

## STRATEGIES FOR INCLUSION

### Making High Quality History and Citizenship Education More Inclusive and Accessible

#### Selection of Existing Resources and Recommendations

#### *Analysis Report*



## Table of Contents

Executive Summary	3
1. Introduction (purpose of collecting the existing resources and contributors' acknowledgment)	3
2. Thematic Focus: The Relevance of the Selected Resources for Making History and Citizenship Education More Inclusive	4
3. Summary Reports (History Education, Citizenship, Deaf and Hard-of-Hearing, Blind and Partially-Sighted, Inclusive History and Citizenship Education, Motivation Barriers)	7
a. Summary Report on Citizenship Education Recourses	7
b. Summary Report on Designing Inclusive Educational Resources	9
c. Summary Report on Motivation for Learning and the Barriers to Learning Civics and History	11
d. Summary Report on Recourses for Students Who are Deaf or Hard-of-Hearing	14
e. Summary Report on Recourses for Students Who are Blind and Partially-Sighted	17
f. Summary Report on Learning History for Students Who are Deaf and Hard of Hearing	19
4. Conclusion and Recommendations	21

## **Executive Summary**

There are many resources teachers of History and Citizenship can choose from to support the development of exciting and engaging education. However, not all education support materials produced by organisations, commercial publishers, or special interest groups, which claim to offer “off-the-shelf” solutions, are of the same high quality. This Analysis Report aims to serve the function of a route map to a selection of quality resources in the field of Inclusive History and Citizenship Education for subject teachers, educators, policy makers and a wider audience. It is important that teachers develop critical skills to select from available resources such as books and other published materials, visual aids, video materials, software and websites. Meantime it should also be noted that due to limited amount of time and scope for the implementation of this specific intellectual output of the project, the presented selection is not exhaustive. Thus, this Analysis Report covers analysis of a selection of a limited amount of resources and serve to increase awareness of the educators on the existing research and findings in the target field and encourage them to explore more.

### **1. Introduction (purpose of collecting the existing resources and contributors’ acknowledgment)**

The selection of existing resources on History and Citizenship Education and Inclusive Education under “Strategies for Inclusion- Making High Quality History and Citizenship Education More Inclusive and Accessible” (STRA4INC) project has been done primarily to build on previous experience and achievements accomplished by other similar projects and interventions. Another key purpose of having all these recourses in one place is to make it easier for teachers, other educational professionals, experts and policy makers to have a direct access to high quality history and citizenship education resources as well as inclusive education resources.

The collection of existing resources has been done by the project consortium partners led by EUROCLIO-European Association of History Educators and coordinated by the Armenian Center for Democratic Education-CIVITAS, (Armenian-CIVITAS) NGO. The successful completion of the collection of existing resources became possible through extensive contributions and recommendations by the consortium partner organizations’ (Agrupamento de Escolas Coimbra Centro/Agrupamento de Escolas de Montemor-o-Velho, Zavod za gluhe in naglušne Ljubljana /Ljubljana School for the Deaf, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, NTNU, Amsterdam University of Applied Sciences) team members, experts and other associates from Portugal, Slovenia, Norway and the Netherlands. The consortium partners’ associates out of the partner countries especially those of EUROCLIO members and associate members have had significant contribution into enriching this collection of resources as well.

While selecting and recommending these specific resources from the bulk of worthy others, the consortium partners coordinated by Armenian-CIVITAS identified a set of selection criteria such as thematic relevance, teaching and learning value and the overall quality. Especially for the

“quality” as there is no universally accepted definition for quality, the consortium partners have applied several sub-set of criteria such as *Materials by Popular Authors; Favorable Reviews; Literary Merit and Contribution; Attention of Critics and Reviewers, Award Winners; Reputation or Authority of the Author, Creator, or Publisher; Quality of Writing, Production, and Illustrations; Contemporary Pedagogical Theories*.

Under the sub-criterion of “*Materials by Popular Authors*”, the selected resources are publications by authors who are experts in the field of teaching history and civic education. Previous publications of these authors are widely used as textbooks and learning materials by teachers and special educators, which motivate students to use the skills and knowledge they have gained to participate in making a difference in their community.

The sub-criterion of “*Favorable Reviews*” by experts and field professionals identifies the resources that undertake a thorough meta-analysis of current teaching methodologies in the field of SEN and/or special education. The preference is given to methodologies applied in the teaching process by teachers of History and Civic Education for children with special education needs, which promote the development of an informed, effective, and responsible citizenry.

“*Attention of Critics and Reviewers, Award Winners*” works that have been evaluated by critics and reviewers, as well as contain motifs on civic knowledge, civic skills, and civic dispositions, have been awarded an international prize and/or books with high impact factor are given priority preference.

“*Literary Merit and Contribution to the Field of Knowledge*” sub-criterion highlights the resources of high quality of writing and contributions to the field of History and Civic Education.

Under “*Reputation or Authority of the Author, Creator, or Publisher*” preference have been given to works of authors that have been extensively published. The resources with valid ISBN have been given priority preference.

Resources describing current and newly developed methodologies that have been evaluated by different experts and are proven to be effective educational tools for teaching History and Civic Education to children with special education needs comply with quality criterion agreed as “*Contemporary Pedagogical Theories*”.

## **2. Thematic Focus: The Relevance of the Selected Resources for Making History and Citizenship Education More Inclusive**

Charles H. Wesley claims that teachers while teaching History and Citizenship education face two problems: The first one is the overall question of methods: “*How to teach history and citizenship education to make it interesting and remembered?*” It is important to pass on to the teacher practical suggestions upon specific problems in method, with the hope that the teaching of history may

become more pleasurable and profitable exercise to both teacher and pupil, and that it may cease to be the deadening grind of memorizing which it has been to the average student in the past.

The second problem of an actual teacher is the diversity in the classrooms, which is becoming more and more widespread. Teachers very often feel challenged by having children in their classrooms who come from various national and religious backgrounds, having different social status, mental and physical skills, children not mastering the language or having poor knowledge of the language. To handle this challenge, teachers have a strong need of resources for high quality history and citizenship education and inclusive education<sup>1</sup>.

The collection of resources recommended in this database can be thus divided into two major categories: a. *Resources on High Quality History and Citizenship Education*, and b. *Resources on Inclusive History and Citizenship Education*.

The reason for recommending several high-quality history and citizenship education resources is that they help students distinguish between authority and power, learn how to choose candidates for leadership positions, analyze benefits and costs of authority, and evaluate, take, and defend positions on the proper scope and limits of authority, distributive, corrective, and procedural justice while evaluating, taking, and defending positions on issues of justice<sup>2</sup>.

Teachers and teacher trainers face many challenges in tackling the issue of inclusive history teaching. A way to handle the issue is to have inclusive practices enshrined in all history teaching to meet the needs of diverse classrooms. By putting inclusion at the heart of its approach to teaching and learning, History reflects students' needs and their context. It responds to their aspirations and it prepares them for their future as citizens in a diverse multi-cultural, multi-faith and multi-ethnic society. Thus, History is relevant; it is also engaging and enjoyable, accessible and challenging

This collection of resources provides different books, articles and teaching/learning electronic and video materials which can help teachers to make the class of History more inclusive. The videos present innovative ways to support learners to better comprehend the content. They also enhance the motivation of learners to talk about what they have learned while allowing the instructor to analyze the depth of the student's understanding. This method of teaching can be useful also for students with learning disabilities and special education needs.

In some cases, History can be an inspirational and rewarding, yet in others it can seem “dry” and of little relevance. These resources will help teachers to organize their History classes in a way that students will find interesting, enjoyable and purposeful. They incorporate a wide range of ideas about the teaching History with practical suggestions for classroom practice. Materials

---

<sup>1</sup> Charles H. Wesley. (1916). *The Problem of Sources and Methods in History Teaching*. Retrieved on 10/01/17 available on [www.howard.eu](http://www.howard.eu) website.

<sup>2</sup> Center for Civic Education. (1993, 2005). *Foundations of Democracy. Authority. Privacy. Responsibility. Justice*, Calabasas, CA.

include suggestions for further reading, web resources and presents a range of clues enabling teachers to create an authentic teaching and learning environment in their classrooms.

The History Education resources in the database support the inclusive development of schools, and help all school players to find their own follow up steps in developing their teaching and learning settings. The materials are designed to build on the wealth of knowledge and experience that people have about their practices.

In the collected resources, there are also materials, articles, and videos that include interactive reading programs, as well as interactive and adaptive computer programs, which guide the learning process by reacting continuously to actions and responses of users.

Teachers can adopt different approaches to improve the quality of sensory information available to children with visual and hearing impairments: they may try to increase children's vocabulary knowledge.

Books, articles and video materials such as WatchKnowLearn<sup>3</sup> for general education classroom teachers, special education teachers, members of multidisciplinary education team are included in the resources on inclusive history and citizenship education. They will assist in the preparation of those individuals for their roles in meeting the educational needs of people with exceptionalities. Some materials are focused on educational adaptations, assistive technologies. Video materials, built-in quizzes, and other interactive ways help to prepare the teacher to effectively teach the range of students with special educational needs in the typical classroom.

There are valuable resources for supporting the inclusive development of schools, including the comprehensive document that help educators to build up their own inclusive classroom practices and settings. The materials are designed to build on the wealth of knowledge and experience that people have about their practice. Some guidelines are intended to

- provide information and awareness,
- be a policy tool for revising and formulating Education Funding Agency plans, and
- to serve as a basis for discussion among policymakers, educators, NGOs and international organizations impacting policy in both private and public education and concerned with promoting access for all learners, provide rights-based tools for Inclusive Education for children with disabilities meant to serve as a reference for advocacy and policy making to UNICEF's government counterparts and other partners in Central and Eastern Europe and the Commonwealth of Independent States.

---

<sup>3</sup> Educational videos. Retrieved on 24/02/2017 available on <http://www.watchknowlearn.org> website.

### **3. Summary Reports (History Education, Citizenship, Deaf and Hard-of-Hearing, Blind and Partially-Sighted, Inclusive History and Citizenship Education, Motivation Barriers)**

To make this Collection of Existing Recourses/Database on High Quality History and Citizenship Education and Inclusive Education more user-friendly for all interested parties and stakeholders, the consortium partners have come up with brief summaries per category. The summaries overall have come to answer the following principal questions such as what kind of materials and resources have been recommended in that specific category and why those materials; how teachers, experts and other educational professionals can use them?

#### **a. Summary Report on Citizenship Education Recourses**

**Tigran Tovmasyan, Armenian Center for Democratic Education-CIVITAS**

The materials presented in this collection present wide variety of education for democratic citizenship and human rights education resources promoting active participation of learners. The materials require different active and interactive teaching and learning approaches. Some of them are focusing on developing fundamental values and principles of democracy<sup>4</sup>, many of them represent learning units well integrating democratic citizenship and human rights<sup>5</sup>. Finally, *Project Citizen* is “an interdisciplinary curricular program for middle, secondary, and post-secondary students, youth organizations, and adult groups that promote competent and responsible participation in local and state government. The program helps participants learn how to monitor and influence public policy. In the process, they develop support for democratic values and principles, tolerance, and feelings of political efficacy<sup>6</sup>”.

All the included materials help learners to strengthen their civic knowledge, develop intellectual and participatory skills, and foster reasoned commitment to democratic values and human rights principles<sup>7</sup>. This fact helps teachers to select carefully and use those materials based on abilities of students, including classification of functions<sup>8</sup> of students with hearing and visual impediments identified in their individual learning plans or specified in national curriculum frameworks. The materials provide the foundation to marginalized students including those with disabilities needed to become responsible participating citizens and develop effective, creative communication skills, as well as develop more positive self-images and confidence in exercising their rights and

---

<sup>4</sup> Foundations of Democracy: Authority, Privacy, Responsibility, and Justice. (1995). Available on [www.civiced.org](http://www.civiced.org)

<sup>5</sup> Peter Krapf.(2010). Taking part in democracy. EDC/HRE lesson plans for upper secondary level. Available on [www.coe.int](http://www.coe.int).

<sup>6</sup> Project Citizen. Program. Available on [www.civiced.org](http://www.civiced.org) website.

<sup>7</sup> Rolf Gollob,Peter Krapf. (2008). Teaching democracy. A collection of models for democratic citizenship and human rights education. Available on [www.dswy.eu](http://www.dswy.eu) website.

<sup>8</sup> International classification of functioning, disability and health: children & youth version. (2007). Available on [www.who.int](http://www.who.int) website.

responsibilities. Needless to say that all the materials are interdisciplinary and integrative, and enhance student motivation through establishing links between different themes and topics.

The teaching and learning resources<sup>9</sup> are based on three important dimensions: a. *learning about democratic citizenship and human rights* covering knowledge domain about democracy and human rights and mechanisms for protection and promotion of them; b. *learning through human rights* when the content and the learning process are carried out in a way that integrates values and principles of democracy and human rights; c. *learning for human rights* that enables opportunities for learners to engage in experiences and situations leading to materializing democratic and human rights values and dispositions, and advocating for democratic lifestyle.

First, teachers and instructors of history and citizenships education need to carefully plan and articulate the learning materials with the needs and requirements of learners, map their skills and abilities and use cooperative learning approaches to create synergy in their classrooms. The individual learning plans of students with hearing and visual impediments are crucial to plan, track and assess their individual progress and achievements. Second, collaborative classroom environment should be established and corresponding learning print and electronic (including video-materials) aids developed for integration of children with disabilities. As the learning process requires out-of-classroom, extracurricular activities, not only collaborative teams should be established, but also the needs and abilities of students with disabilities should be considered and peer-support ensured. Next, the assessment tests and rubrics, performance assessment methods and guidelines should be adjusted for children with disabilities and added in their individual learning plans. Finally, learners should reflect their experience on what and how they learnt, what they learnt being part of a collaborative team working to solve a problem, and what are the advantages and disadvantages of working with children with disabilities.

#### Suggestions for further reading

- *Foundations of Democracy. Authority. Privacy. Responsibility. Justice* - The Foundations of Democracy series consists of curricular materials for use with students from kindergarten through twelfth grade on four concepts fundamental to an understanding of politics and government: Authority, Privacy, Responsibility, and Justice. This multidisciplinary curriculum draws upon such fields as political philosophy, political science, law, history, literature, and environmental studies<sup>10</sup>.
- Sample lesson plans on civic education<sup>11</sup>.
- *Compass. Manual for Human Rights Education with Young People* - *Compass* and its publication in various language versions has been the medium through which human rights

---

<sup>9</sup> *Compass: Manual for Human Rights Education with Young People*. Available on [www.coe.int](http://www.coe.int) website.

<sup>10</sup> *Foundations of Democracy*. Available on [www.civiced.org](http://www.civiced.org) website.

<sup>11</sup> Lesson plans. Available on [www.civiced.org](http://www.civiced.org) website.



education has been brought onto the agenda of youth work and into the curricula of many schools<sup>12</sup>.

- *Lesson Plans for ages 9-11 in Civic Education*: These lessons are designed to help students differentiate between the things they want and the things they need. The children will be introduced to the idea that people's most basic needs are considered rights<sup>13</sup>.
- *Revitalizing Civic Learning in Our Schools*: National Council for the Social Studies<sup>14</sup>
- *The Rights and Diversity Education Centre*- provides resource enrichment and curriculum training and advice across the Equalities and United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child agendas<sup>15</sup>.
- *Rights Respecting Education* - enables teachers to navigate their own route in developing rights respecting education (RRE) in their respective schools<sup>16</sup>.
- *Play It Fair!* - an innovative program implemented in day camps and after school programs across Canada that increases children aged 6-12 understanding of human rights, respect for diversity and peaceful conflict resolution<sup>17</sup>.
- *Civic Education in Primary and Secondary Schools in the Republic of Serbia*<sup>18</sup>.
- *Human Rights Education in the School Systems of Europe, Central Asia and North America: A Compendium of Good Practice*<sup>19</sup>.
- *Advanced Cooperative Learning* (D. Johnson, R. Johnson and E. Holubec) – the book presents recommendations for teachers on how to implement effective and collaborative learning by combining theory, research and practical application to the classroom.

## **b. Summary Report on Designing Inclusive Educational Resources**

**Steven Stegers, EUROCLIO**

There is a wealth of resources available on designing educational resources in general that are also relevant for those making resources for learning history and citizenship. This summary introduces some of issues that you should take into account when developing educational resources as well as resources that provide support to address these issues, and give suggestions on where to look for more information.

*Choosing a font that can be read by most:* All designers of educational resources need to choose which fonts to work with. Some fonts are easier to read than others, especially for people with

---

<sup>12</sup> Compass: Manual for Human Rights Education with Young People. Available on [www.coe.int](http://www.coe.int) website.

<sup>13</sup> Lesson plans for ages 9-11 in Civic Education: Refugee Children. (2013). Available on [www.unhcr.org](http://www.unhcr.org) website.

<sup>14</sup> Revitalizing Civic Learning in Our Schools. (2013). Available on [www.socialstudies.org](http://www.socialstudies.org) website

<sup>15</sup> The RADE Centre. Available on [www3.hants.gov.uk](http://www3.hants.gov.uk) website.

<sup>16</sup> Rights Respecting Available on [www3.hants.gov.uk](http://www3.hants.gov.uk) website.

<sup>17</sup> Play it Fair. Available on [www.equitas.org](http://www.equitas.org) website.

<sup>18</sup> Alan Smith, Susan Fountain, Hugh McLean. (2002) Civic Education in Primary and Secondary Schools in the Republic of Serbia. Available on [www.unicef.org](http://www.unicef.org) website.

<sup>19</sup> Human Rights Education in the School Systems of Europe, Central Asia and North America: A Compendium of Good Practice. (2009). Available on [www.osce.org](http://www.osce.org) website.

Dyslexia, who experience difficulties with reading or interpreting words, letter or other symbols. On this overview you can see which fonts that are commonly available and are easy to read for people with Dyslexia (and others as well).<sup>20</sup>

*Ensuring that essential difference in color is visible:* Another choice that has to be made is the choice of **colors** to use in educational resources. Some choices may affect the learning of people who are color-blind, for example when they are working with maps or graphs. You can see how people who are color-blind are seeing an image using this color blindness simulator.<sup>21</sup> If you make material that is likely to be printed in black and white, but you design it in color, you can check whether the essential details are still distinct enough. You can use this online grayscale image generator to see how this looks and adapt were needed.<sup>22</sup> By making educational resources suitable for black and white printing you make these assessable at lower costs than colored printing.

*Offering choice:* Inclusive educational resources should take into account that learners have different interest.<sup>23</sup> By introducing the element of choice, you increase the chance that learners find something that close to their interest.

*Providing support:* One way of removing barriers to learning is to provide support to those students who need this. This can take a variety of forms. For example, by suggesting “Search Terms” of providing suggested resources for further research to students, by providing explanations of terms that might be unknown in a glossary or footnotes, or by providing starting sentences that students can use to begin writing their essay.

*Providing challenge:* Sometimes students need to be challenged, instead of supported, to perform better. When designing inclusive educational resources, it is important to also take these students into account.

*Using assessment to improve learning:* Inclusive assessment is an approach to assessment in mainstream settings where policy and practice are designed to promote the learning of all pupils as far as possible.<sup>24</sup> This guide by Natalie Regier gives 60 formative assessment strategies can give some inspiration of how assessment can not only be used for grading, but to find out more about the needs and level of competence of the individual learner.<sup>25</sup>

*Avoiding stereotypes in your educational resources:* Some educational resources re-enforcing stereotypes through these educational materials thereby enlarging divisions in society. On this page, David M. Sadker lists seven forms of bias in instructional materials which gives a first idea

---

<sup>20</sup> Typefaces for Dyslexia. Available on [www.dyslexic.com](http://www.dyslexic.com) website.

<sup>21</sup> Coblis-Color Blindness Simulator. Available on [www.color-blindness.com](http://www.color-blindness.com) website.

<sup>22</sup> Grayscale Photo Effect Generator. Available on [www.picturetopeople.org](http://www.picturetopeople.org) website.

<sup>23</sup> UDL Guidelines - Version 2.0: Principle III. Provide Multiple Means of Engagement. Available on [www.udlcenter.org](http://www.udlcenter.org) website.

<sup>24</sup> Outline Indicators for Inclusive Assessment. Available on [www.european-agency.org](http://www.european-agency.org) website.

<sup>25</sup> Natalie Regier, M. Ed. (2012). Focus on Student Learning-Instructional Strategies Series. Available on [www.stma.k12.mn.us](http://www.stma.k12.mn.us) website.

of the different ways in which you could promote stereotypes.<sup>26</sup> This model for the evaluation of bias content in instructional materials developed by Washington State includes a checklist that you can use to analyze, evaluate and on the basis of this adapt your own resources.<sup>27</sup> Because it is more challenging to identify biases in your own resources you could ask someone else to do the review.

*More information:* Because this summary only scratches the surface of what is available, it is worth looking for more information. A good place to find more information about the design of educational resources is the website of CAST on Universal Design for Learning.<sup>28</sup> CAST is a non-profit education research and development organization that works to expand learning opportunities for all individuals.

### **c. Summary Report on Motivation for Learning and the Barriers to Learning Civics and History**

**Arie Wilschut, Center for Applied Research in Education, Amsterdam University of Applied Sciences**

Motivation for learning is one of the key factors that influence the outcomes of a learning process, perhaps the most important one. Teachers can influence the motivation of their students to a great extent. Research has shown that it doesn't matter so much which measures are taken: all strategies that can influence motivation have proven to be more or less equally effective (Lazowski & Hulleman, 2016). Summing up the results of the most important motivation research (Pintrich, 2003; Pintrich & de Groot, 1990; Ryan & Deci, 2000), we can distinguish the following six categories of factors that may influence the motivation of students:

*1 Competence and self-efficacy:* an area that refers to (realistic) beliefs students have that they are able to do something and can reach certain learning goals.

*2 Autonomy, control and attribution:* an area that refers to the degree in which students are in control of their own learning and can attribute their (lack of) successes to the right causes.

*3 Relatedness and feeling accepted:* an area that refers to the degree to which students feel accepted by their teachers and peers and experience their learning environment as 'safe'.

*4 Situated interest:* an area that refers to ways in which teachers can elicit interest by providing exciting and varied learning tasks.

*5 Value expectancy:* an area that refers to ways in which students expect to benefit from their learning effort, seeing that things they learn could be useful.

*6 Goal orientation:* an area referring to the way education should be oriented on concrete learning goals to be reached, giving a clear direction to students' learning activities.

---

<sup>26</sup> Some Practical Ideas for Confronting Curricular Bias. Available on [www.sadker.org](http://www.sadker.org) website.

<sup>27</sup> Washington Models for the Evaluation of Bias Content in Instructional Materials. Available on [www.k12.wa.us](http://www.k12.wa.us) website.

<sup>28</sup> About Universal Design for Learning. Available on [www.cast.org](http://www.cast.org) website.

If we try to relate these six motivation areas to the barriers to learning civics and history as identified in the document *Policy Recommendations*, it is obvious that not all barriers can be cleared out of the way by educational practices based on motivation theory. Some of them need pedagogical approaches specific to teaching civics and history. But perhaps the following relations may appear to be feasible in solving parts of the educational problems connected to the identified barriers to learning.

*Barriers 1 and 2* (referring to the problem that students do not see the use of history and civics and are not able to see the connection between these school subjects and their own daily world) may be approached from the perspective of *motivation area 5: value expectancy*. In this context teachers are advised to provide tasks, material, and activities that are relevant and useful to students and to focus classroom discourse on importance and utility of the learning content and activities. It means that an effort should be made to find materials and examples that make the connection between school subject matter and daily life outside school very apparent.

*Barriers 3 and 4* (referring to the problem of the strange and distant world presented in history lessons, which as a matter of fact is considered less important by students than the world of the present they live in) may be approached from the perspective of *motivation area 4: situated interest*. In this context teachers are advised to stimulate interest by providing exciting and diversified tasks, to provide content material that is personally meaningful to students and to display themselves model interest and fascination. It means that an effort should be made to find materials and examples that are surprising and exciting, that show unexpected connections between then and now, remarkable details that draw attention and strong stories with obvious (moral) lessons.

*Barriers 5 and 6* (referring to the problem of not being able to take other perspectives seriously and reasoning from the perspective of a we-group that sometimes even excludes others) may have something to do with *motivation area 3: relatedness*. In this context teachers are advised to create an atmosphere in which every student feels accepted and secure in a group. This has more to do with classroom management and classroom discourse than with concrete teaching materials. Materials that train students in the skill of perspective taking can promote this particular cognitive skill, but it is doubtful if this will solve a motivational problem connected with feeling accepted by a group and experiencing a learning environment as safe.

*Barriers 7, 8 and 9* (referring to intellectual skills specifically needed for civics and history, such as critical thinking, unbiased thinking, critical and well-founded judgment) deal with areas of learning which are intellectually demanding and will therefore not easily create feelings of success. To direct learning in these contexts, a clear *goal orientation (motivation area 6)* may be useful. In this respect teachers are advised to organize their lessons in such a way that personal and social responsibility are stimulated, to provide a predictable learning environment, and to use cooperative

and collaborative groups to allow for opportunities to attain both social and academic goals. Teachers are also advised to employ manners of evaluation that promote learning, effort, progress, and self-improvement. This means that materials should be looked for that make cooperative learning possible and that create clear chances for advancing towards specific learning goals. Dealing with these barriers from the perspective of *motivation areas 1 and 2 (creating feelings of success and attributing success to the right causes)* may also be helpful. In these contexts, teachers are advised to provide clear feedback about students' competence and self-efficacy and about the process and strategies of learning, to design tasks that offer opportunities to be successful, but are also challenging for students, as well as to provide opportunities for students to choose for themselves, and to build supportive and caring relationships in the community of learners. Most of these do not refer to specific teaching materials, but more to classroom management and teaching discourse.

*Barrier 10* (referring to the problem of learning a specific language which is necessary for learning civics and history) is probably also best served by motivational approaches which make feelings of success possible and which strive for clear and reachable learning goals, while attribution of failure and success is performed in relation to the right causes (*motivation areas 1, 2 and 6*). Also in this case attention should be paid to the organization of a goal oriented curriculum, careful feedback and providing tasks at the right level tuned to the specific situation of the learner.

#### Suggestions for further reading

Lazowski, R.A., & Hulleman, C.S. (2016). Motivation Interventions in Education: A Meta-Analytic Review. *Review of Educational Research*, 86 (2), 602-640.

Pintrich, P.A. (2003). A Motivational Science Perspective on the Role of Student Motivation in Learning and Teaching Contexts. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 95 (4), 667-686.

Pintrich, P.A., & De Groot, E.V. (1990). Motivational and Self-Regulated Learning Components of Classroom Academic Performance. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 82 (1), 33-40.

Boekaerts, M. (2002). *Motivation to Learn*. Brussels: International Academy of Education / Geneva: International Bureau of Education (UNESCO).

Hattie, J.A.C. (2009). *Visible Learning: A Synthesis of Over 800 Meta-Analyses Relating to Achievement*. London / New York: Routledge.

Marzano, R. (1992). *A Different Kind of Classroom: Teaching with Dimensions of Learning*. Alexandria: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Ryan, R.M., & Deci, E.L. (2000). Self-Determination Theory and the Facilitation of Intrinsic Motivation, Social Development, and Well-Being. *American Psychologist*, 55 (1), 68-78.

## **d. Summary Report on Recourses for Students Who are Deaf or Hard-of-Hearing**

Živa Ribičič, Zavod za gluhe in naglušne Ljubljana

The selected resources on deafness can be divided into three thematic groups:

- General information on deafness
- Teaching deaf and hard of hearing students
- Assistive technologies - ICT use and support

**I.** It is suggested that teachers who are not familiar with the topics, start to study sources with general information on special needs, such as:

1. *Educating Exceptional Children*<sup>29</sup>, (Samuel Kirk, James J Gallagher, Mary Ruth Coleman, Nicholas J. Anastasiow). The book has been designed as a guide for general education classroom teachers, special education teachers, members of multidisciplinary education teams. It will assist in the preparation of those individuals for their roles in meeting the educational needs of people with special needs or as authors call them – children with exceptionalities. The Chapter 10 focused on educational adaptations for children who are deaf or hard of hearing.

2. *Exceptional Lives: Special Education in Today's Schools*<sup>30</sup>, (Turnbull, Ann P.; and Others). Introductory text on special education, three introductory chapters discuss: today's students, families, friends, and communities; current trends concerning zero reject policies, non-discriminatory evaluation, and appropriate education; and the inclusion and collaboration movements. Each chapter typically offers vignettes of real students, categorical information, evaluation procedures, issues for professionals (focusing on curriculum and methods that promote inclusion and collaboration), program options, a vision for the future, and suggested resources and references. One chapter speaks more about deaf and hard of hearing.

**II.** After a general study on these topics it is recommended to start studying sources of methods and classroom management when having deaf students in general settings, such as:

1. *Teaching special students in general education classrooms*<sup>31</sup>, (Rena B. Lewis, Donald H. Doorling). This book prepares future teachers for the challenges of inclusion and gives them the background to work with a wide range of students in a variety of educational settings in the elementary and secondary classroom. Text demonstrates how to identify pupils who have

---

<sup>29</sup> Kirkn Gallagher, Anastasiow. (2012). *Educating Exceptional Child*. Available on [www.books.google.com](http://www.books.google.com) website.

<sup>30</sup> Turnbull, Ann P.; And Others. (1995). *Exceptional Lives: Special Education in Today's Schools*. Available on [www.eric.ed.go](http://www.eric.ed.go) website.

<sup>31</sup> Rena B. Lewis, Donald H. Doorlag. *Teaching Special Students in General Education Classrooms*. Available on [www.wps.prenhall.com](http://www.wps.prenhall.com) website.

learning problems and provides the tools necessary to help these children succeed in general education classrooms. The book concentrates on techniques that will improve academic performance; classroom behavior; and social acceptance for students with disabilities, gifted and talented students, culturally and linguistically diverse students, and students at-risk. Each chapter is introduced with real life examples of those students and helps to clarify several legal concepts as well as the most recent terminology used in the area of special education as such it can be used for history teachers as a basic tool when having deaf or hard of hearing student or student with other special needs in the classroom.

2. A Co-Teaching Model: Committed Professionals, High Expectations, and the Inclusive Classroom<sup>32</sup>, (Lindeman, Karen Wise; Magiera, Kathleen, *New Directions in Deaf Education*, v15 p40-45 2014). This article relates the story of a first-grade teacher and a child who was the only deaf student in the entire school. Here they explore why this collaborative model worked and how a group of professionals from different disciplines, each with different goals for the student and with no experience working with a deaf child with a cochlear implant, came together to make Jeffery's year a success.

3. Educating deaf learners: Creating a Global Evidence Base<sup>33</sup>, (Harry Knoors, Marc Marschark). Teachers can learn different ways to improve the quality of sensory information available to deaf children's, they may try to increase deaf children's vocabulary knowledge. Book also introduces information regarding interactive reading programs, and interactive and adaptive computer programs, which can guide the learning process by reacting continuously to the actions and responses of the user.

**III.** For deaf and hard of hearing, the use of ICT is quite crucial but you need to consider adaptations when using it in classrooms:

1. Supporting Social Competence in Children Who Use Augmentative and Alternative Communication<sup>34</sup>, (Amie M. King and Allison J. Fahsl, *TEACHING Exceptional Children September-October 2012 45: 42-49*). This article is focused on teaching the children, who need alternative ways of communication. The article focus on two case studies – one girl has a severe learning disabilities and on boy who has many communicational problems due to autism and he is also a Latino descent. The authors offer 6 tables for teachers – with those you can test the students' competences before offering him AAC device: Communicative Competence Inventory and follow a progress while using it.

---

<sup>32</sup> Lindeman, Karen Wise; Magiera, Kathleen. (2014). A Co-Teaching Model: Committed Professionals, High Expectations, and the Inclusive Classroom. Available on [www.eric.ed.gov](http://www.eric.ed.gov) website.

<sup>33</sup> Oxford: New York, NY: Oxford University Press, [2015].

<sup>34</sup> Amie M. King, Allison J. Fahsl. (2012). Supporting Social Competence in Children Who Use Augmentative and Alternative Communication. Available on [www.journals.sagepub.com](http://www.journals.sagepub.com) website.

2. Captions, Whiteboards, Animation, and Videos: Technology Improves Access<sup>35</sup>, (Jennifer S. Beal-Alvarez and Joanna E. Cannon). The field of deaf education lacks rigorous research that supports any singular instructional practice. However, studies indicate that technology, frequently used during instruction with students who are deaf or hard of hearing, is motivating for students, and that it can facilitate student learning.

3. The role of video technology in on-line lectures for the deaf<sup>36</sup>. Article explain how to prepare online lectures for deaf. There has been a 10 minutes' video about Deaf history used as an example of good practice.

4. E-learning material planning and preparation. In EU project BITEMA the main aim was to prepare guidelines for teachers who are teaching deaf and hard of hearing students. Guidelines are formed in a way to support teachers with little or no knowledge of deaf to be able to prepare online materials for deaf. The main aim is to support teachers in adopting materials/ lectures for deaf students<sup>37</sup> or contact to [ziva.ribicic@zgnl.si](mailto:ziva.ribicic@zgnl.si)

#### Suggestions for further reading

- More reading about inclusion for deaf and hard of hearing, benefits and limitations.<sup>38</sup>
- More about ICT and deafness: Assistive Technology and Learning Disabilities Today's Realities and Tomorrow's Promises – about the current status of assistive technology for this population and reflects on future promises and potential problems.<sup>39,40</sup>
- Jose Uses his AAC Device<sup>41</sup>: Video about a use of AAC – an example of teacher and student communication with AAC device also the basic signs from sign language are used what helps a student to communicate more efficiently.

---

<sup>35</sup> Jennifer S. Beal-Alvarez and Joanna E. Cannon. Captions, Whiteboards, Animation, and Videos: Technology Improves Access. Available on [www.eric.ed.gov](http://www.eric.ed.gov) website.

<sup>36</sup> M Debevc et al. [Disabil Rehabil](#) 26 (17), 1048-1059. 2004 Sep 02. Available on [www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov) website.

<sup>37</sup> BITEMA - Documents. Available on [www.medijske.um.si](http://www.medijske.um.si) website.

<sup>38</sup> Educating Children Who Are Deaf or Hard of Hearing: Inclusion. ERIC Digest #E557. (1997). Available on [www.ericdigests.org](http://www.ericdigests.org) website.

<sup>39</sup> Rena B. Lewis, PhD Rena B. Lewis. (1998). Assistive Technology and Learning Disabilities. Today's Realities and Tomorrow's Promises. Available on [www.journals.sagepub.com](http://www.journals.sagepub.com) website.

<sup>40</sup> Assistive Devices for People with Hearing, Voice, Speech, or Language Disorders. Available on [www.nidcd.nih.gov](http://www.nidcd.nih.gov) website.

<sup>41</sup> Jose Uses his AAC Device. Available on [www.youtube.com](http://www.youtube.com) website.



- Assistive Technology and Learning Disabilities Today's Realities and Tomorrow's Promises – about the current status of assistive technology for this population and reflects on future promises and potential problems.<sup>42</sup>
- The role of video technology in on-line lectures for the deaf, *Disability and rehabilitation*, 2004, vol. 26, no.17.
- More information about BITEMA project<sup>43</sup> and [ziva.ribicic@zgnl.si](mailto:ziva.ribicic@zgnl.si)

## e. Summary Report on Recourses for Students Who are Blind and Partially-Sighted

Andreja Trtnik Herlec, Zavod za gluhe in naglušne Ljubljana

The selected resources on blindness can also be divided into two thematic groups:

- Teaching blind and partially sighted students
- Assistive technologies

I. It is suggested that the teachers who are not familiar with the topics start to study sources including general information on special needs. But for teaching visually impaired students it is crucial to get access to special education activities for the blind and partially sighted, namely O&M (Orientation and Mobility), Communication Skills, ADL (Activities of Daily Living), Sports and leisure time activities, and Social Skills and Socialization.

1. *Educating Exceptional Children*<sup>44</sup>, (Samuel Kirk, James J Gallagher, Mary Ruth Coleman, Nicholas J. Anastasiow). The book has been designed as a guide for general education classroom teachers, special education teachers and members of multidisciplinary education teams. One of the chapters focuses on educational adaptations for the children who are blind and partially sighted.

2. *Exceptional Lives: Special Education in Today's Schools*<sup>45</sup>, (Turnbull, Ann P.; and Others). Introductory text on special education discusses the current trends concerning zero reject policies, non-discriminatory evaluation, appropriate education and the inclusion and collaboration movements. Each chapter offers vignettes of real students, categorical information, evaluation procedures, issues for professionals (focusing on curriculum and methods that promote inclusion and collaboration), program options, a vision for the future, and suggested resources and references. One chapter concentrates on the blind and partially sighted.

3. *Teaching special students in general education classrooms*<sup>46</sup>, (Rena B. Lewis, Donald H. Doorling). This book prepares future teachers for the challenges of inclusion and gives them the background to work with a wide range of students in a variety of educational settings in the elementary and secondary classroom. The book concentrates on the techniques that will improve academic performance, classroom behaviour and social acceptance for students with disabilities, gifted and talented students, culturally and linguistically diverse students, and students at-risk. Each chapter is introduced with real life examples and can be used for

history teachers as a basic handbook for teaching students with special needs, including the blind and partially sighted.

**II.** For the blind and partially sighted the use of ICT and other adaptations and reproductions are very important.

Lina Canas / Liliana Fernandes: Meet our Neighbours and Meet our Neighbours: Sun  
This is a model of learning about the Solar System with a handbook for teaching the blind and partially sighted.

Social Studies: How people behave in society includes interactive exercises for the blind.

Monica Brady-Myerov; Social Studies Lessons All Lessons Science includes Listen Current, which is educational programme transmitted via public radio, very suitable for the blind (2016).

Walt Henley PhD: Free Educational videos Connecting Students to the World: WatchKnowLearn includes 50,000 videos that need to be described in the audio mode.

### Suggestions for further reading

Practical suggestions for the teachers can be found at the following sites:<sup>47</sup>

Carmen Willings (teachingvisuallyimpaired.com) gives the following advice about learning using timelines, graphs and charts: it is essential for classroom teachers and the Teacher of the Visually Impaired to collaborate in order for the latter to have time to create accessible maps and materials, models of historical objects etc.

If videos are shown, audio descriptions will need to be provided. Keep the information presented on the map as simple as possible. Solid textures are easier to discriminate than just outlining shapes: cardboard, corkboard, ceiling tiles and styrofoam. Lines (twine, plastic coated wire, yarn), points (hole-punched circles, nail heads, or small beads), secondary

---

<sup>42</sup> Rena B. Lewis, PhD Rena B. Lewis. (1998). Assistive Technology and Learning Disabilities. Today's Realities and Tomorrow's Promises. Available on [www.journals.sagepub.com](http://www.journals.sagepub.com) website.

<sup>43</sup> BITEMA - Documents. Available on [www.medijske.um.si](http://www.medijske.um.si) website.

<sup>44</sup> Kirkn Gallagher, Anastasiow. (2012). Educating Exceptional Child. Available on [www.books.google.com](http://www.books.google.com) website.

<sup>45</sup> Turnbull, Ann P.; And Others. (1995). Exceptional Lives: Special Education in Today's Schools. Available on [www.eric.ed.go](http://www.eric.ed.go) website.

<sup>46</sup> Rena B. Lewis, Donald H. Doorlag. Teaching Special Students in General Education Classrooms. Available on [www.wps.prenhall.com](http://www.wps.prenhall.com) website.

<sup>47</sup> Teaching Students with Visual Impairments. Available on [www.teachingvisuallyimpaired.com](http://www.teachingvisuallyimpaired.com) website.

information (felt, soft fabric), and significant information (sandpaper or textured paper and fabric).

More educational strategies can be found in:

Holbrook and Koenig. (2000). Foundations of Education, Second Edition Vol II: Instructional Strategies for Teaching Children and Youths with Visual Impairments. A comprehensive compilation of best practices specific to each area of the core curriculum.

Spunqin, Susan. When You Have a Visually Impaired Student in Your Classroom: A Guide for Teachers. American Foundation for the Blind, 2002. This guidebook is written for teachers and addresses how to effectively work with a student with visual impairments and introduces special devices that may be used by the student.

## **f. Summary Report on Learning History for Students Who are Deaf and Hard of Hearing**

**Lise Kvande, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, NTNU**

Inclusive teaching is much about *how* to teach students with special needs, such as students that are deaf or hard of hearing. However, looking at an overwhelming amount of policy documents, we have to think about each student as a unique person and thus with his/her own special needs. Teachers should take each student's world view as a point of departure for learning. The question at stake is not merely about *how to do* things but rather about *what* the students should learn and *why* they should learn this rather than that. In addition, there is a question about *whose* history that is presented; for whom history is written.

Regarding history education some concepts are central to the what- and why-questions. Relevance and significance (for the students) are two of these and they are crucial for feeling connectedness and motivation for learning history (barriers 1 and 2). These challenges are common for all teachers and learners regardless of disabilities.

In the collected resources, there are some publications about such challenges. The article of Andreas Körber deals with historical consciousness and competencies and invites to reflections about the what and why-questions.<sup>48</sup> He offers analytical categories and deals with – among other themes – modes of narration and a model for historical thinking. The article gives some solutions to most of the barriers identified in this project.

The book by Haydn, Stephen, Arthur and Hunt also deals with the purpose of history education and how to make history significant and purposeful for the students.<sup>49</sup> When Körber discusses these issues within a theoretical and analytic frame, Haydn et.al. come to terms with the theme

---

<sup>48</sup>Körber, Andreas. (2015). Historical consciousness, historical competencies – and beyond? Some conceptual development within German history didactics. Available on [www.pedocs.de](http://www.pedocs.de) website.

<sup>49</sup>Terry Haydn, Alison Stephen, James Arthur, Martin Hunt. (2015). Learning to Teach History in the Secondary School: A companion to school experience. Available on [www.routledge.com](http://www.routledge.com) website.

through combining overall perspectives to history teaching with how to deal with these challenges in practice. The book has an own chapter on how to ensure inclusion; purposes and benefits of history education, historical understanding, and more such as assessment and new technologies in the classroom. The combination of history didactics theory and its practical use in the classroom makes this a very useful source for preparing relevant and engaging teaching.

### Suggestions for further reading

Regarding history teaching of deaf students one needs to see the combination of identity linked to their disability (deafness) but not at least their possible feeling of belonging to another society; the deaf society, as a transnational cultural community with its own history and identity (deafhood).<sup>50</sup> History has to take the students' identity into account to make the subject meaningful (relevant, significant). There are lots of publications (books and articles) presenting and discussing this double and sometimes contradictory experiences and negotiations between being deaf in the one sense and the other.

History and Citizenship Education might strengthen each other whether one calls it the phenomenon of historical consciousness or not. A vital concept here is *empowerment*; how to help students see themselves as not only products but also producers of history. This means an education with a purpose of supporting the development of students to become active, analytical, critical citizens. This purpose is as much important for students with special needs than for the average ones and it addresses the basic questions of *why* and *what* that must be the point of departure for the question of *how*. There are lots of good publications on such perspectives. Some literature, available online: Davies, Ian (ed.); *Debates in History Teaching*, Taylor & Francis, 2010<sup>51</sup>

The anthology deals, among other issues, with questions about the purpose of history teaching and whether moral learning is an aim; the relationship between academic and school history; standards for teachers' knowledge; use of ICT; evidence; assessment. As an anthology one might find useful chapters without reading the whole book. This publication deals in varying degree with all the recognized barriers; so also with the following ones<sup>52</sup>

A good possibility for inclusive history education lies in Eustory's annual history competition.<sup>53</sup> This competition asks students to investigate and write about parts of their family histories and to contextualize the personal story they want to tell. The competition is carried out in several

---

<sup>50</sup> It is very important to keep in mind that the matter of connectedness and identity to a deaf community is not important, and even not wanted, to all students that are deaf or hard of hearing. A lot of students see the maintenance of a deaf culture as an obstacle to being included in a hearing society; they wish to be seen as average students with minor challenges. Teaching students with challenges of hearing, thus has to identify (to some extent) their expressed identity regarding deafness and/or deafhood to include them *in one way or the other*.

<sup>51</sup> Ian Davies. (2010). *Debates in History Teaching*. Available on [www.tandfebooks.com](http://www.tandfebooks.com) website.

<sup>52</sup> Wilschut, Arie & Symcox, Linda (eds.). (2009). *National History Standards: The Problem of the Canon and the Future of teaching History*, Series: *International Review of History Education*, Information Age. Available on [www.ed.s.b.ebscohost.com](http://www.ed.s.b.ebscohost.com) website.

<sup>53</sup> Eustory. Available on [www.eustory.eu](http://www.eustory.eu) website.

countries and the best contributions are presented on eustory.eu. The competitive element is not the central here, rather, it offers a possibility to dig into the lives and circumstances for (some) relatives in the past. Thus, the competition is inclusive per se, and can help overcome barriers (1-9) such motivation; connectedness; past and present; imagining the past; perspective taking; historical distance; unbiased and unprejudiced thinking; critical thinking about facts and fiction; comparison and judgment – possibly also regarding language skills.

The well-organized modus of this competition, that among other things include certain kind of education of the teachers involved, gives teachers an opportunity to deal with meaningful history teaching within a professional, transnational community and thus strengthening their own motivation for teaching. This seems even more important for teachers dealing with students with special needs.

A general and easy accessed source for dealing with inclusive education in history is also EUROCLIO's homepage<sup>54</sup>. EUROCLIO carries out a lot of projects in Europe that might new input for teachers engaged in history education in general or facing students situated in other settings than the majority. This resource, offering learning and thus motivation, should be known by history teachers in general.

#### **4. Conclusion and Recommendations**

The consortium partners strongly believe this collection of existing resources on high quality History and Citizenship Education and Inclusive Education accomplished under “Strategies for Inclusion- Making High Quality History and Citizenship Education More Inclusive and Accessible” (STRA4INC) project with all its limitations can serve as a hands-on tool and a resource database for further reference for teachers, educational practitioners, experts and policy makers to have an easy access to quality resources.

The six thematic units of this collection of resources (History Education, Citizenship Education, Recourses for students who are deaf or hard-of-hearing, and Recourses for students who are blind or partially-sighted, Resources on Motivation and Learning Barriers and Inclusive Education Recourses) are there for the users who are particularly interested in making their History and Citizenship teaching/learning inclusive and of higher quality.

This collection of resources has more than 100 entries and the interested users can find teaching and learning materials, articles and reports, books, educational web recourses on History and Citizenship Education. They will also find recourses on recommended approaches and methodology on how to make History and Citizenship Education more inclusive and accessible for all.

---

<sup>54</sup> EUROCLIO. Available on [www.euroclio.eu](http://www.euroclio.eu) website.